The Upper Crust

Once a lowly frozen convenience food, potpie is showing up in restaurants across the country—and with fillings that transcend chicken (think pheasant, oxtail, and pork), Robbie Arnold-Starr of Belcampo in Los Angeles says, "There's a bit of serenity making a stew and then rolling out the dough for it—it's almost like meditation." Mindfulness aside, these golden, puffed stunners are on menus mostly because "people want to have that emotional experience that comfort food can bring," says Daniel Humm of the NoMad Bar in New York City. And what's not to get emotional about when you're forking through a hot, buttery crust to reach a rich, tender stew on a cold night? Here's where to dig in.

Belcampo Meat Co.

Los Angeles

This butchery-restaurant sources meat from its own cows in the Shasta Valley, and Arnold-Starr thought that using their tails was a great way to avoid wasting an underutilized cut. "Oxtail has a lot of collagen and gelatin that comes out when slow-cooked," he says. "It creates a great base." Acorn squash, leek, and fried sage round it out.

Le Pigeon

Portland, Oregon

Two of the most popular dishes here are the smoked-rabbit-Cheddar pie with a mustard-infused savory "ice cream" and the bacon-and-el pie with broccoli cream (the cardyni kale, salty bacon, and cooling ice cream are delicious). The latter nods to a British el pie, except Gabriel Rucker makes his with unagi marinated in soy, sugar, and mirin. It's "about layering flavors," he says. "Smoky, sweet, savory.

The Forge

Miami

Christopher Lee had the provocative idea to put a vegetarian dish on a steakhouse menu. His black-truffle mac-and-cheese potpie (technically a side, but often ordered as an entrée) forgets bread crumbs for a crust and combines Parmesan, mascarpone, Cheddar, raclette, and preserved black truffles. "We go through 20 to 30 a night," Lee says.

Cilo

Boston

Ken Dringer pays homage to a French cooking legend with his black-truffle-and-foie gras potpie, a play on the truffle soup Paul Bocuse made for French president Valéry Giscard d'Estaing in 1978. Dringer's version includes a truffle forage of pig's feet and chicken fat. "It has that rich mouthfeel," Dringer says. Bonus: Servers score the top and pour a slow-cooked egg at the table.

High West Distillery & Saloon

Park City, Utah

The two surprise ingredients in Ashley Chapman's chicken version? Rye whiskey, which "brings a sweet, slightly spiny character to the broth that gives the dish a lighter finish," he says, and locally hunted pheasant.

The NoMad Bar

New York City

Your waiter will crack the crust of this chicken potpie, stir in black-truffle cream, and slide in a skewer of foie gras. "The foie gras and black truffle bring luxury to a dish that's often sociable," says Humm, who was looking for the bar equivalent of the famous truffle- and-foie-gras-stuffed roast chicken served at the NoMad, the sibling restaurant. "I want diners to feel warm and full and, when done, ready for a nap."